EMPLOYMENT AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS LAW SUMMARY

LAWSKOOL.COM.AU

LAWSKOOL PTY LTD
TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Labour Law Theories .............................................................................................................. 14
   1.1 Theory 1 (Left wing) – The power imbalance ................................................................. 14
   1.2 Theory 2 (Right wing) – The free market is the best protection for both workers and business ........................................................ .................................................. 14
   1.3 Theory 3 (Middle) – The third way ..................................................................................... 15
2. The Constitutional foundation ................................................................................................. 16
3. Growth of Commonwealth influence ..................................................................................... 17
4. Globalising Forces .................................................................................................................. 17
5. Moving to new Heads of Power ............................................................................................. 18
   5.1 The referral power – s 51(xxxvii) .................................................................................. 22
   5.2 The Referral by Victoria .................................................................................................. 23
6. The debate over a national system ......................................................................................... 24
   6.1 Arguments in Favour of a National System ................................................................... 25
   6.2 Arguments Against a National System .......................................................................... 27
7. The Role of the Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) ......................................................................... 28
   7.1 The Common Law ........................................................................................................... 28
   7.2 The Statutory Framework ............................................................................................... 29
   7.3 Overarching Provisions ................................................................................................. 30
8. Equality .................................................................................................................................. 31
9. Privacy ................................................................................................................................... 32
10. Surveillance ............................................................................................................................ 32
Topic 2: Anti-Discrimination .................................................. 34
  2.1 Direct discrimination .................................................... 35
  2.2 Indirect discrimination .................................................. 38
  2.3 Sexual Harassment ...................................................... 42
    2.3.1 Special Measures – s 7D ............................................ 45

Topic 3: The Employment Relationship - Contractor or Employee? .......... 46
  3.1 Employees ................................................................. 46
  3.2 Contractors ............................................................... 46
    3.2.1 The Control Test / Multi-Factor Test .......................... 47
    3.2.2 Applying the test .................................................... 47
  3.3 Case law examples of employees .................................... 49
  3.4 Case law examples of contractors .................................. 50
  3.5 Non-standard forms of work ......................................... 51
    3.5.1 A note on taxation .................................................. 51
    3.5.2 Insurance ............................................................... 52
  3.6 Sham Contracts & Protections regarding independent contractors .... 52

Clements, Dunne & Bell Pty Ltd v Commissioner, Australian Federal Police [2001] FCA 1858 (20 December 2001) ............................................. 53

  3.7 Common Law Employment Contracts ................................ 54
  3.8 Principles of Employment Contracts .................................. 55
    3.8.1 Offer and acceptance .............................................. 55
    3.8.2 Intention ............................................................... 56
    3.8.3 Consideration ....................................................... 56
    3.8.4 Capacity and legality ............................................. 56
  3.9 Regulation of employment contracts .................................. 57
  3.10 The relationship of contracts to other sources of industrial relations law .... 58

Topic 4: Rights and Responsibilities ........................................ 59
  4.1 Express terms of employment contracts ............................ 59
    4.1.1 Construing a contract ............................................ 59
4.2 Implied Terms and Common Law Duties ................................................................. 60

4.2.1 Service earns remuneration .............................................................................. 60

4.2.2 There is a duty for Employees to obey reasonable demands ............................... 61

4.2.3 Duty of care and competence ........................................................................... 61

4.2.4 No Duty to Provide Work .................................................................................. 61

4.2.5 Duty to provide a safe workplace and indemnify .............................................. 62

4.2.6 Duty of Good Faith – owed by employees to employers .................................. 63

4.2.7 Duty of Good Faith – owed by employers to employees .................................... 64

**Topic 5: Work Standards** ......................................................................................... 66

5.1 Sources of employment standards .......................................................................... 66

5.2 Workplace Policy Documents and Employment Contracts ................................... 66

**Topic 6: Terms and Conditions of Employment** ..................................................... 70

6.1 Overview ............................................................................................................... 70

6.2 National Employment Standards .......................................................................... 70

6.2.1 Part 2.2 – National Employment Standards ...................................................... 70

6.2.2 Relationship of NES with other instruments ..................................................... 72

6.3 Modern Awards .................................................................................................... 73

6.3.1 Part 2.3 – Modern Awards ................................................................................ 73

6.3.2 Content required ............................................................................................... 74

6.3.3 Unlawful content .............................................................................................. 74

6.3.4 Duration ............................................................................................................ 75

6.4 The National Minimum Wage ................................................................................ 75

6.5 Fair Work Act: Part 2.4 – Enterprise Agreements (Enterprise Bargaining) .......... 75

6.5.1 Key provisions .................................................................................................. 76

6.6 Content of enterprise agreements ........................................................................... 78

6.6.1 Mandatory terms .............................................................................................. 78

6.6.2 Unlawful terms ................................................................................................. 78

6.7 Approval procedures of enterprise agreements .................................................... 79

6.7.1 Pre-approval requirements ................................................................................ 79
6.8 Enforcement, variation and termination ........................................... 79

6.8.1 Greenfields .................................................................................. 80

Topic 7: Trade Union Law ....................................................................... 81

7.1 Historical foundation – Marx ............................................................. 81

7.2 The role of trade unions .................................................................... 81

7.3 Industrial Action - Strikes ................................................................. 82

7.3.1 Industrial action under common law ............................................. 83

7.3.2 Industrial action under the Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) .................. 84

7.3.3 Industrial torts .............................................................................. 85

7.3.4 Regulation of industrial torts under the Fair Work Act ................. 87

7.3.4 Secondary boycotts and the Competition and Consumer Act ......... 87

7.4 Trade Union Accountability ............................................................... 88

7.5 Trade union entry into the workplace .............................................. 92

7.5.1 GROCON Dispute ....................................................................... 93

7.5.2 Responsible unionism .................................................................. 93

7.6 Good Faith Bargaining ..................................................................... 94

7.6.1 The BHP Decisions ..................................................................... 95

7.6.2 The QANTAS Dispute .................................................................. 97

7.7 Trade Union Royal Commission ..................................................... 100

7.7.1 What is a Royal Commission? .................................................... 100

Topic 8: Termination of Employment .................................................... 102

8.1 Common law principles .................................................................... 104

8.1.1 Wrongful dismissal ................................................................. 104

8.1.2 Summary dismissal ................................................................... 105

8.1.3 Constructive dismissal ............................................................... 105

8.1.4 Reasonable notice ...................................................................... 106

8.1.5 Resignation ............................................................................... 107

8.1.6 Revocation of offers or acceptance .......................................... 107

8.1.7 Special conditions ...................................................................... 108
12.1 Investigations that have gone wrong ........................................................................ 136

Topic 13: Work Health and Safety ...................................................................................... 140

13.1 Nationally consistent framework .............................................................................. 140

13.2 Central provisions of the model laws ......................................................................... 141

13.2.1 Duties of persons conducting a business or undertaking ........................................ 142

13.2.2 Offences .................................................................................................................. 144

13.2.3 Duties of workers .................................................................................................... 146

13.2.4 Duties of other persons at the workplace ................................................................ 146

13.3 Nexus between the model laws and the *Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth)* ..................... 147

SOURCES CONSULTED ....................................................................................................... 148
# TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

## Cases

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Achal v Electrolux Pty Ltd</td>
<td>1993</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACT Visiting Medical Officers Association v AIRC</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adami v Maison De Luxe Limited</td>
<td>1924</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adams v Union Cinemas Ltd</td>
<td>1939</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addis v Gramophone Co Ltd</td>
<td>1909</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aldridge v Booth &amp; Ors</td>
<td>1986</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amalgamated Society of Engineers v Adelaide Steamship Co</td>
<td>1920</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ansett Transport Industries (Operations) Pty Ltd v Australian Federation of Air Pilots</td>
<td>1991</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ashton v Wall &amp; Anor</td>
<td>1992</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian Air Express v Langford</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian Boot Trade Employees’ Federation v Whybrow &amp; Co</td>
<td>1910</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian Building and Construction Commissioner v Parker</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian Iron &amp; Steel Pty Ltd v Banovic</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australian Iron &amp; Steel Pty Ltd v Banovic</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AWU v BHP Iron-Ore Pty Ltd</td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baker v Markellos</td>
<td>2012</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barratt v Howard</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bendigo Regional Institute of Technical and Further Education v Barclay</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FCR 212</td>
<td></td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bennett &amp; Anor v Everitt &amp; Anor</td>
<td>1988</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bird v Biraban Local Aboriginal Land Council</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blackadder v Ramsay Butchering Service Pty Ltd</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boehringer Ingleheim v Reddrop</td>
<td>1984</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boin v Harvey (No WO1742358 Victorian Mags Ct March 2008)</td>
<td></td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Byrne v Australian Airlines</td>
<td>1995</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cahill v Big W Ltd</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carlill v Carbolic Smoke Ball Co</td>
<td>1893</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clements, Dunne &amp; Bell Pty Ltd v Commissioner, Australian Federal Police</td>
<td></td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coal and Allied Operations v Australian Industrial Relations Commission</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FCR 194</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commissioner of State Revenue v Mortgage Force Australia Pty Ltd</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concut Pty Ltd v Worrell</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Daley v Public Transport Corporation of Victoria (1998) 119 IR 242 ........................................... 106
Davies v Davies (1887) 36 CH D 359 .................................................................................. 57
Deatons Pty Ltd v Flew (1949) 79 CLR 370 ................................................................. 124
Delaney v Staples [1992] 2 WLR 451 .......................................................... 107
Digital Pulse Pty Limited v Christopher Harris [2002] NSWSC 33 ......................... 64
Director of the Fair Work Building Industry Inspectorate v Powell [2016] FCA 1287 (3 November 2016) ................................................................. 147
Dollar Sweets Pty Ltd v Federated Confectioners Association of Australia [1986] VR 383 ................................................................. 86
Elazac Pty Ltd v Shirreff [2011] VSCA 405 ................................................................. 50
Endeavour Coal Pty Limited v Association of Professional Engineers, Scientists and Managers, Australia [2012] FCA 764 ................................................................. 97
Ermogenous v Greek Orthodox Community of SA Inc [2002] HCA 8 ......................... 56
Escobar v Rainbow Painting (2002) 120 IR 84 ......................................................... 39
Ex Parte HV McKay (1907) 2 CAR 1 ................................................................. 75
Faccenda Chicken Ltd v Fowler [1986] 1 All ER 617 .................................................... 128
Faccenda Chicken Ltd v Fowler [1987] 1 Ch 117 ......................................................... 63
Fair Work Ombudsman v Jooine (Investment) Pty Ltd & Anor [2013] FCCA 2144 (20 December 2013) ................................................................. 54
Foreign Affairs and Trade v Styles (1989) 23 FCR 251 ............................................. 35
General Engineering Services v Kingston and St Andrews Corporation [1988] 3 All ER 867 ................................................................. 84
Goldman Sachs JBWere Services Pty Ltd v Nikolich (2007) 163 FCR 52 ........................ 69
Hall & Ors v A & A Sheiban Pty Ltd & Ors (1989) EOC ¶92-250 ............................ 43
Hamlyn & Co v Wood & Co [1891] 2 QB 488 ......................................................... 55
Harris v Digital Pulse Pty Ltd [2003] NSWCA 10 ....................................................... 64
Hartley’s v Martin [2002] VSC 301 ....................................................................... 126
Harvester Case (1907) ...................................................................................... 75
Harvey v RG O’Dell Ltd [1958] 2 QB 78 ................................................................. 124
Heape v General George Carpets Pty Ltd (2002) EOC ¶ 93-237 ............................. 38
Heptonstall v Gaskin (No 2) [2005] NSWSC 30 ..................................................... 65
Herbert Morris v Saxelby [1916] 1 AC 688 .............................................................. 125
Hill v CA Parsons Limited [1972] Ch. 305, CA ....................................................... 107
Hughes Aircraft Systems International v Air Services Australia (1997) 146 ALR 1 .............. 57
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Humberstone v Northern Timber Mills</td>
<td>1949</td>
<td>79 CLR 389</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jarratt v Commissioner for Police for New South Wales and Another</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>HCA 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JJ Savage &amp; Sons Pty Ltd v Blakney</td>
<td>1970</td>
<td>119 CLR 435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lee v Smith &amp; Ors (No. 2) [2007] FMCA 1092</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lister v Romford Ice &amp; Cold Storage Co Ltd [1957] AC 555</td>
<td>1957</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lloyd's Shipping [1987] FCA 70</td>
<td>1987</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M'Dowell v Ulster Bank [1899] 33 IR LT Jo 223</td>
<td>1899</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahesan v Malaysia Government Officers’ Co-operative Housing Society Ltd</td>
<td>1979</td>
<td>AC 374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malik v Bank of Credit and Commerce International SA (In liq) [1998] AC 20</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>64, 65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McManus v Scott-Charlton [1996] 140 ALR 625</td>
<td>1996</td>
<td>61, 131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mill v Hawker [1874] LR 9 Ex 309</td>
<td>1874</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nash v Silver City Drilling (NSW) Pty Ltd; Attorney General for New South Wales v Silver City Drilling (NSW) Pty Ltd [2017] NSWCCA 96 (16 May 2017)</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New South Wales v Amery [2006] 230 CLR 174</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nordenfelt v Maxim Nordenfelt Guns and Ammunitions Co Ltd [1894] AC 535</td>
<td>1894</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSW v Lepore (2001) 52 NSWLR 420</td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O’Neill v Medical Benefits Fund of Australia (2002) 122 FCR 455</td>
<td>2002</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oscar Chess Ltd v Williams [1957] 1 WLR 370</td>
<td>1957</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland v Parr [1927] 1 KB 236</td>
<td>1927</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qantas Airways Ltd v Australian National Travel Service Managers’ Union</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R v Kelly; Ex parte Victoria (1950) 81 CLR 64</td>
<td>1950</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reddrop v Boehringer Ingelheim Pty Ltd [1984] EOC ¶92-031</td>
<td>1984</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renard Constructions (ME) Pty Ltd v Minister for Public Works [1992]</td>
<td>1992</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reynolds v The Minister For Health &amp; Anor [2010] FMCA 843</td>
<td>2010</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Riverwood International Australia v McCormick (2000) 177 ALR 193</td>
<td>2000</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robb v Green [1895] 2 QB 315</td>
<td>1895</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roy Morgan Research Pty Ltd v Commissioner of Taxation (2011) 244 CLR 97</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: lawskool.com.au
Sanders v Parry [1967] 1 WLR 753 ................................................................. 63
Saunders v Snell (1998) 196 CLR 329 ....................................................... 107
Secretary of State for Employment v Associated Society of Locomotive Engineers and Firemen (No 2) [1972] QB 455 ............................................................. 84
Shamir v Commonwealth of Australia (Australian Taxation Office) [2015] FCA 1463 (21 December 2015) ................................................................. 147
Spring v Guardian Assurance Plc [1995] 2 AC 296 ........................................ 65
State of New South Wales & Ors v Commonwealth [2006] HCA 52 ............ 21
Stephens v Ewall (1815) 4 M & S 259 ......................................................... 122
Stevens v Brodribb Sawmilling (1986) 160 CLR 16 .................................... 47
Sweeney v Boylan Nominees Pty Ltd (2006) 226 CLR 161 ............................ 50
Tenuyl v Delaney & Anor (1996) EOC ¶92-836 ......................................... 44
Thomas Marshall (Exports) Ltd v Guinle [1979] 1 Ch 227 ........................... 63
Tillman’s Butcheries Pty Ltd v A-Asian Meat Industry Employees Union of Australia (1979) 41 FLR 27 .......................................................... 88
Toll (FGCT) Pty Ltd v Alphapharm Pty Ltd (2004) 219 CLR 165 ................ 69
Transport Workers’ Union of Australia v Cement Australia Pty Ltd [2015] FWC 158 (20 April 2015) .......................................................... 146
United Firefighters’ Union of Australia v Metropolitan Fire Brigades Board (1998) 86 IR 340 ............................................................... 84
UWA v Grey (No 20) 2008 FCA 498 ......................................................... 129
Victoria Park Racing Grounds v Taylor (1937) 58 CLR 479 ....................... 32
Victoria University of Technology v Wilson (2004) 60 IPR 392 ................ 130
Victoria v Commonwealth (1996) 135 ALR 129 ..................................... 19
Victoria v Schou (2004) 8 VR 120 ............................................................ 39
Victorian WorkCover v Game (2007) 16 VR 393 ..................................... 50
Village Cinemas Australia Pty Ltd v Carter (2007) 158 IR 137 .................. 108
Visscher v Giudice [2009] HCA 34 .......................................................... 104
Waterhouse v Bell (1991) EOC ¶92-376 .................................................. 37
Wormold Australia Pty Ltd v Harward and Venning (1992) 42 IR 166 ....... 105
Statutes

Anti-Discrimination Act 1977 (NSW) ................................................................. 34, 38
Australian Securities and Investments Commission Act 2001 (Cth) ................. 91
Commonwealth Conciliation and Arbitration Act 1904 (Cth) .................................. 28, 29
Commonwealth Powers (Industrial Relations) Act 1996 (Vic) .............................. 23
Competition and Consumer Act 2010 (Cth) ...................................................... 87
Constitution of the Commonwealth of Australia .................................................. 16
Corporations Act 2001 (Cth) ................................................................................ 56, 115
Disability Discrimination Act 1992 (Cth) ............................................................. 34, 40, 42
Discrimination Act 1991 (ACT) ............................................................................. 34
Employee’s Liability Act 1991 (NSW) .................................................................. 122
Equal Opportunity Act 1984 (SA) ........................................................................... 34
Fair Work Act 2009 (Cth) 25, 28, 30, 32, 34, 46, 52, 53, 54, 57, 66, 70, 72, 73, 74, 75, 76, 77, 78, 79, 81, 83, 84, 85, 87, 92, 93, 102, 108, 109, 116, 118, 119
Federal Awards (Uniform System) Act 2003 (Vic) ................................................. 24
Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission Act 1986 (Cth) ..................... 34, 137
Independent Contractors Act 2006 (Cth) ................................................................ 51, 52
Industrial Relations Act 1988 (Cth) ........................................................................ 19, 20, 87
Industrial Relations Act 1991 (NSW) .................................................................... 30
Industrial Relations Act 1996 (NSW) ..................................................................... 57
Industrial Relations Reform Act 1993 (Cth) .......................................................... 29, 118
Insurance Contracts Act 1984 (Cth) ....................................................................... 122
Minors (Property and Contracts) Act 1970 (NSW) .................................................. 57
Occupational Health and Safety Act 1984 (WA) ..................................................... 140
Occupational Health and Safety Act 2004 (Vic) ..................................................... 140
Privacy Act 1988 (Cth) .......................................................................................... 32
Public Service Act 1999 (Cth) .................................................................................. 131
Racial and Religious Tolerance Act 2001 (Vic) ....................................................... 34
Sex Discrimination Act 1984 (Cth) ......................................................................... 34, 42
Telecommunications (Interception and Access) Act 1979 (Cth) ........................... 33
Trade Practices Act 1974 (Cth) ............................................................................... 108
Work Health and Safety (National Uniform Legislation) Act 2011 (NT) ................ 140
Work Health and Safety Act 2011 (ACT) ............................................................... 140
Work Health and Safety Act 2011 (Cth) ................................................................. 140

X v Commonwealth (1999) 200 CLR 177 ............................................................... 42
Zuijs v Worth Bros (1955) 93 CLR 561 ..................................................................... 48
Work Health and Safety Act 2011 (NSW) ................................................................. 140, 145
Work Health and Safety Act 2011 (Qld) ................................................................. 140
Work Health and Safety Act 2012 (SA) ................................................................. 140
Work Health and Safety Act 2012 (Tas) ................................................................. 140
Workers Compensation Act 1912 (WA) ................................................................. 51
Workplace Relations Act 1996 (Cth) .................................................................... 20, 52, 62, 66, 77, 87
Workplace Relations and Other Legislation Amendment Act (No 2) 1996 (Cth) ...... 23
Workplace Relations and Other Legislation Amendment Act 1996 (Cth) ................. 29
Workplace Surveillance Act 2005 (NSW) ................................................................. 33

Other Authorities

Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work 1998 ............................. 32
Declaration on Social Justice for a Fair Globalization .............................................. 18
Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise Convention, 1948 117
International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights ......................... 117
Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 ........................... 117
Topic 1: The Source of Labour Law

There are a variety of ways in which people may ‘work’ and hence, be regulated by the broad framework of employment and industrial relations law. Work may be defined in terms of both ‘productive labour’ that produces commercial wealth, and ‘reproductive labour’ that produces and allows other people to engage in productive labour.¹

The context of industrial relations law is made up of economic, social and cultural factors. In addition, the political context of the law of work is informed by the nation state acting as a key player in regulating various forms of work at local, national and international levels. Through work, people develop a relationship of interdependence with society, and form groups with collective opinions on issues of work to be regulated.

1.1 Labour Law Theories

1.1.1 Theory 1 (Left wing) – The power imbalance

Otto Kahn-Freund: Labour and the Law

“It is the theory of English law that a contract is a freely concluded agreement. The norm postulates an exchange of offer and acceptance. Precisely this legal institution however has been put to the service of monopoly. The monopolist and his client are parties to a ‘contract.’ A passenger who takes a railway ticket ‘accepts’ the terms offered by the company…Conditions by which a monopolist excludes or limits his liabilities are ‘deemed’ to have been freely accepted if reasonable notice was given to the other party eg…”

Kahn-Freund believed the contract for employment was merely a submission by the employee to the predetermined terms and conditions which the employer chose. Therefore, the contract for employment was a farce due to the power imbalance between the employer and employee – Result = take it or leave it scenario. His position represents the prevailing theory in Australia during 1900s – 1970s, formation of trade unions to temper the strength of employers. Accordingly, he argued the law should step-in to protect employees and reduce the power and influence of employers.

1.1.2 Theory 2 (Right wing) – The free market is the best protection for both workers and business

Hayek: The Constitution of Liberty

¹ R Owens, J Riley and J Murray, The Law of Work (2nd ed, 2011), [1.1.1].
“Freedom is seriously threatened today by the tendency of the employed majority to impose upon the rest their standards and views of life…Whoever desires a regular income for which he sells his labour must devote his working hours to the immediate tasks which are determined for him by others…the risk of sacrifice in giving up his job may often be so great as to make him continue in it, even though he intensely dislikes it…”

Hayek disagreed with the views of Otto Kahn-Freund. The themes woven through his work are: individualism, freedom, private ownership and the rule of law (as opposed to the pursuit of social goals by Government). Trade unions were viewed as coercive and large governments as arbitrary (and therefore undesirable).

Accordingly, Hayek believed the growth of an advanced society was only possible through individual freedom. The individual must be able to use their own talents and build their own property. The answer for individual suffering is not for the government to intervene on their behalf. Likewise, trade unions, which pursue industrial ends, were considered coercive and ultimately pushed labour costs so high as to cost jobs. The purpose of a trade union, according to Hayek, should be little more than a friendly society – assisting employees in choosing between jobs offered on the employer’s terms. Employers are, after all, actually the supporters of working people – without their growth and wealth (that purchases the means of production), there would be no jobs at all.

Wedderburn criticised Hayek’s work – polar and lacks shades of grey. He considered employment processes enable economic growth which is paramount. If employees don’t like it, too bad because when the market is strong, employment is relatively secure and workers can change jobs if they do not like the way in which they are being treated.

Hayek represents an extreme argument against both power imbalance and any extensive government intervention. He supports employers and believed the more support given to employers, the more businesses will prosper, the more businesses that prosper, the more jobs and in-turn, the more economic growth there will be. Hayek noted trade unions could operate in their own interests but considered it important to advance the interests of businesses, entrepreneurs and those avenues that will make opportunities to employ others.

1.1.3 Theory 3 (Middle) – The third way

Hugh Collins: Labour Law as a Vocation

“The source of inequality of bargaining power should not be exaggerated; most employers are subject to the capital market ...and employees may find jobs elsewhere...Explanations of
the source of subordination of employees, which rely upon the notion of inequality of bargaining power, provide shaky foundations for a concept of Labour Law which sees its vocation in the relief of the subordination of labour.”

Collins argued labour law was not so much a means of addressing social problems as it was a means of dealing with economic problems – it was a means of regulating the labour market and inflation. He claims the lack of bargaining power stems from problems of supply and demand. It is inherent that there will be some imbalance between employer and employee and trade unions are the only way to address that imbalance – should be noted that whilst necessary, unions can have flaws.

His argument acknowledged pros and cons with each so why not take the best of theory 1 and the best of theory 2 and meld to form the mantra: ‘Flexibility and fairness are mutually supporting goals, not mutually exclusive goals’.

Collins accepted there were some instances where workers will be at a tremendous disadvantage to their employers and he hastens to add that ‘we should not lose sight of Kahn-Freund’s analysis altogether’. He suggests that organisational structures (workplace hierarchies) are the real cause of problems for working people – he, therefore, favours minimum conditions and changes to corporate law as a ‘safety net’.

1.2 The Constitutional foundation
By virtue of the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Australia, Australia is a federation – this means there is a distribution between state and federal powers.